

Chullin – Simanim

פרק ז – גיד הנשה

דף ק – 100 Daf

1. חתיכה הראויה להתכבד בה

The Mishnah on Daf 96b taught that if a גיד הנשה was cooked with other גידין and could not be identified, all the גידין are forbidden. The Gemara asks: *but let [the גיד הנשה] become nullified in the majority of permitted גידין?* It answers: *ברייה שאני – a complete creation is different*, i.e., is significant, and cannot be nullified. The Mishnah also taught that if a slice of נבילה (or nonkosher fish) became mixed with kosher slices and cannot be identified, they are all prohibited. The Gemara asks, again, that the prohibited slice should be nullified by the majority of permitted slices!? It ultimately answers: *שאני חתיכה – a slice [of forbidden meat or fish] is different*, לפני, הוֹאִיל וְרָאוּיָהּ לְהִתְכַבֵּד בִּהּ – *since it is fit to be honored with by serving it before guests*, and is thus significant and cannot be nullified. The Gemara adds that each of these cases is a separate *חידוש*.

2. חתיכה עצמה נעשת נבלה

Rabbah bar bar Chanah announced that a slice of נבלה cooked together with kosher food (and then removed) only prohibits the food if it is large enough to give flavor to all the food in the pot. However, Rav then announced that once the forbidden slice imparts flavor to a permitted slice separately (e.g., if these two slices were cooked together beforehand), חתיכה עצמה נעשת נבלה – *the formerly permitted slice itself becomes like a neveilah*. This slice will then prohibit all the other slices when its flavor spreads to them, מפני שהן מינה – *because they are its same kind*. Rav Safra asked Abaye that apparently Rav's ruling was following Rebbe Yehudah's opinion that *a kind does not become nullified in its own kind*. If so, even if the second slice did not give flavor to the others, they should be forbidden because of the flavor absorbed from the first slice, regardless of its size!? Abaye answers that Rav's case is *בשקדם וסלקו – where he first removed [the neveilah slice] before adding the other slices*, and only the newly prohibited second slice gives them flavor. Rava answers differently.

3. Machlokes if גיד הנשה applies to nonkosher animals

In the next Mishnah, the Tanna Kamma says that the גיד הנשה prohibition does not apply to טמאה – *a nonkosher [animal]*, but Rebbe Yehudah says it does, arguing that גיד הנשה was forbidden to Yaakov's sons, when nonkosher animals were still permitted. They replied to him that it only became forbidden at סיני, but was written in the Torah at the incident which caused the prohibition. The Gemara asks: Rebbe Yehudah holds *אין איסור חל על איסור – a prohibition cannot take effect on a preexisting prohibition* (e.g., a dead nonkosher bird is only prohibited because it is nonkosher, but not because of *neveilah*). Rebbe Yehudah also holds *יש בגידין בנותן טעם*, and one who eats a גיד הנשה from a nonkosher animal also receives *malkus* for eating nonkosher meat. Finally, the Gemara proves that the גיד forms after the nonkosher status is in effect (when the fetus's limbs develop). How, then, does the גיד הנשה prohibition take effect? The Gemara answers that the גיד הנשה prohibition is able to take effect upon the preceding nonkosher prohibition, שכן איסורו נוהג בבני נח – *because its prohibition applies even to בני נח*, and is thus more stringent.

Siman – Monkey

The owner of exotic **monkeys** was dismayed when the **monkeys** threw a nice slice of *neveilah* into a pot with kosher pieces, all of them worthy of being served to his guests who were invited to view how the **monkeys** removed a piece of *neveilah* from on top of a piece of meat before getting mixed in with the other pieces when he yelled "חנני!", and pointed to the lines marking their גיד הנשה which is forbidden even on non-kosher animals.

DAF 100 | דף ק

Monkey



The owner of exotic **monkeys** was dismayed when the **monkeys** threw a nice slice of *neveilah* into a pot with kosher pieces, all of them worthy of being served to his guests who were invited to view how the **monkeys** removed a piece of *neveilah* from on top of a piece of meat before getting mixed in with the other pieces when he yelled ""חני"ן!"" and pointed to the lines marking their *gid hanishah* which is forbidden even on non-kosher animals.

3 things to remember

1. חתיכה הראויה להתכבד בה
2. חתיכה עצמה נעשת נבלה
3. *Machlokes* if גיד הנשה applies to nonkosher animals

